



**CITY OF ST. PETERSBURG
COMMUNITY PLANNING & PRESERVATION COMMISSION
PUBLIC HEARING**

**Council Chambers
City Hall**

**July 8, 2014
Tuesday, 3:00 p.m.**

MINUTES

Present: Robert "Bob" Carter, Chair
Jeffery "Jeff" M. Wolf, Vice Chair
Will Michaels
Ed Montanari
Gwendolyn "Gwen" Reese
Thomas "Tom" Whiteman, Alternate

Commissioners Absent: Lisa Wannemacher¹
Jeff Rogo, Alternate ¹
Arnett Smith, Jr., Alternate¹ ¹ *excused*

Staff Present: Derek Kilborn, Manager, Urban Planning, Design & Historic Preservation
Aimee Angel, Planner, Urban Planning, Design & Historic Preservation
Mark Winn, Chief Assistant City Attorney, Legal
Vicky Davidson, Administrative Assistant, Planning & Economic Development

The public hearing was called to order at 3:02 p.m., a quorum was present.

I. OPENING REMARKS OF CHAIR AND SWEARING IN OF WITNESSES

II. ROLL CALL

III. MINUTES

The minutes from June 10, 2014 meeting were approved as written by a consensus vote.

IV. PUBLIC COMMENTS

No public comments made.

V. PUBLIC HEARING

Note: Commissioner Whiteman recused himself from the following case due to a conflict of interest.

A. TSPE 2014-01

**Contact Person: Derek Kilborn
893-7872**

Request: City-initiated request for an exception to the Traditional Streetscape Preservation Policy to allow removal of a 6.5-foot wide strip of brick pavement on the east-west alley between Beach Drive Northeast and 1st Street North, and 2nd and 3rd Avenues North. This request is related to the applicant's plan for improving pedestrian connections in and around the Sundial project.

Staff Presentation

Derek Kilborn gave a PowerPoint presentation based on the staff report.

Commissioner Wolf stated his understanding of having a smoother access for people with limited mobility and then asked if there will be any physical separation barrier between the pedestrians and vehicles. Mr. Kilborn stated that the original plan called for a visual delineation but no physical barrier. The proposed area is only 6 ½ feet wide and the concern with a physical barrier is that the pedestrian passageway would be compromised (e.g. a pedestrian walking with another person in a wheelchair unable to pass someone coming from the opposite direction). A seamless connection would allow two-way traffic (e.g. able to cross over the separation line when encountering someone walking in the opposite direction). Mr. Kilborn went on to say that sidewalks are normally six to 10 feet wide allowing two-way traffic and staff feels that maintaining a similar grade with just visually making that distinction is the best approach for this area.

Commissioner Michaels stated his support of the Sundial project and feels that it is a tremendous improvement for the downtown area and for the community as a whole, and wants to see it succeed. Commissioner Michaels went on to say that he disagrees with the historic preservation statement in the final paragraph of the staff report; "Little remains of the brick street network in this area and the area has been completely redeveloped with contemporary structures." Commissioner Michaels stated that the redevelopment seen downtown has maintained a lot of the historic architecture, particularly the Mediterranean Revival style of architecture (e.g. The Florencia, The Cloisters, Park Shore, and The Hampton Inn with the new paver street in front), and there are at least seven brick alleys in the downtown area. Commissioner Michaels then asked if there had been safety issues with the historic brick alleys and streets. Mr. Kilborn replied that he did not have specific numbers with him regarding the safety but will look at and will provide City Council this information during their evaluation of this request. Mr. Kilborn then stated that valid points were made about the brick alleys and the original justification for not removing the subject brick alley during the 2009 improvements is still a consideration today which is why the proposal is limited to just the 6 ½ foot area and not the entire alley itself, recognizing the integrity of the brick alleys downtown and preserving them the best way they could. The subject area is one service alley that has been identified to serve a dual function which is the pedestrian connection to Beach Drive. Staff would not normally recommend an alley to be used for pedestrian connections mid-block, but in this instance that has been identified as a goal in the Sundial's Connector Plan.

Commissioner Michaels stated his appreciation for not including the entire alley and then asked what the proposed pedestrian passageway would be comprised of (i.e. smooth concrete or have some texture). Mr. Kilborn replied that the Commission can make as part of their recommendation to their vote some suggestions

relating to a stamped pattern. Commissioner Michaels stated that he would make that recommendation which

would further help to maintain the historic character of the downtown area.

Commissioner Reese stated that safety is an important consideration for people who wear heels or are unsteady on their feet as she, herself, took a fall walking on a brick alley at a different location and knows how dangerous brick alleys can be.

Commissioner Wolf stated his understanding for a stamped concrete but for safety reasons as stated by Commissioner Reese he would recommend a smooth concrete surface or a very minimal pattern that will not pose a trip hazard. Mr. Kilborn stated his agreement and that any stamped pattern would have to meet the minimum safety requirements that are appropriate for this connection.

Commissioner Michaels voiced his agreement with the primary concern of safety but is trying to find a balance between the historic characters of the brick along with the need to ensure safety and suggested that staff look at the pedestrian crossings in the downtown area which do have that grid pattern.

Commissioner Montanari stated his support of this request and his agreement with Commissioner Michaels. He believes that the downtown area needs to have some uniformity and is in favor of some sort of pattern to be used like the pedestrian crosswalks.

Commission Chair Carter voiced his concern about the overall safety of the alley, itself, due to the numerous service trucks using it to service the Plaza Building, restaurants, and retail businesses in this location. He does not know why the alley is so important other than to the commerce at the Sundial; sidewalks with cut curbs are there allowing people to safely walk to anywhere in the downtown area. Commission Chair Carter went on to say that he feels safety of the citizens is being sacrificed by funneling them down an alley when adequate sidewalks are all around that block and also feels that this alley helps take major traffic off of Beach Drive. He believes that people will walk all over the alley whether there is a pedestrian passageway or not and feels that making an effort to push more people down this heavily-used alley is not a good idea.

Mr. Kilborn commented that in regards to the truck traffic, when improvements were made in 2009 the alley was converted from a two-way service alley to a one-way circulation flow and was signed for no-parking after 11:00 a.m. Some service delivery in the mornings was acknowledged, then after 11:00 a.m. it becomes more pedestrian oriented. In regards to the connection part, in 2009 there was some type of evaluation of the Beach Drive area and how it related to some of the inner core which then resulted in the crafting of the Downtown Activities Center Connector Plan. The subject alley was the one service alley identified for pedestrian enhancements on the assumption that it would help some of the traffic coming in off of Beach Drive. This idea was reinforced in the fall of 2013 when the Urban Land Institute (ULI) review looked at the downtown waterfront and offered a series of comments about the need to prioritize connecting pedestrians from Beach Drive bringing them deeper into the downtown core to further diversify their experience and activities being offered. Today's request is an opportunity to address ULI's recommendation, as well.

Public Hearing

Barbara Karasfik, 7313 Eaton Ct, asked who was paying for this brick removal project. Mr. Kilborn stated that the City would be funding this improvement project.

Executive Session

MOTION: *Commissioner Michaels moved and Commissioner Wolf seconded a motion approving the request in accordance with the staff report with the amendment of staff to consider possible use of the brick pedestrian crossing design consistent with safety.*

Commissioner Wolf stated his understanding of Commission Chair Carter's concerns regarding the vehicular issues but does favor keeping the downtown area as pedestrian-friendly as possible and is in support of creating the pedestrian connector.

Commissioner Reese stated that because Commission Chair Carter had brought up some important issues, she is rethinking her position. She is not sure this request would make it pedestrian-friendly if there are vehicular issues. Commissioner Reese then asked if there were any accident or incident reports that have occurred in this alleyway relating to vehicles and pedestrians. Mr. Kilborn stated that he did not have any specific examples but explained that with this application the City does not expect to control where people go but to better provide a safe and smooth passage through this corridor segment (1st Street to Beach Drive).

VOTE: *YES – Michaels, Montanari, Wolf, Carter
NO - Reese*

Motion was approved by a vote of 4 to 1.

VI. QUASI-JUDICIAL PUBLIC HEARINGS

At the staff's request, the following item (COA 14-90200024) was deferred to the 8/12/14 meeting.

A. COA 14-90200024 **Contact Person: Aimee Angel
892-5470**

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the replacement of all windows and doors with aluminum clad windows and doors at the Coliseum located at 535 – 4th Avenue North.

B. COA 14-90200029 **Contact Person: Aimee Angel
892-5470**

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness approval for the construction of a new single-family residence on a vacant lot located within the Roser Park Historic District.

Staff Presentation

Aimee Angel gave a PowerPoint presentation based on the staff report.

Commissioner Michaels asked if the Roser Park NA was notified, to which Ms. Angel replied, yes.

Applicant Presentation

Not present to speak.

Public Hearing

None

Executive Session

Commissioner Wolf stated that the design appears to be compatible with the neighborhood and is in support.

Commissioner Michaels stated his support of Commissioner Wolf's comments and feels it would be a very good fit for the neighborhood.

Commissioner Whiteman pointed out that masonry will need to be added to the fencing requirement of wood or metal, to which Ms. Angel agreed.

Commissioner Montanari stated that he feels that the home would be appropriate for the neighborhood and then asked if condition #2 on the windows was the owner's preference. Mr. Angel replied that the owner's plans did not specify but having exterior muntins is typically required in historic districts and on individual local landmarks.

Commissioner Montanari asked about the last condition which seems all-encompassing. Ms. Angel stated that this condition will be modified to be limited to only exterior changes.

MOTION: *Commissioner Wolf moved and Commissioner Whiteman seconded a motion approving the Certificate of Appropriateness in accordance with the staff report with the Conditions of Approval amendments made by the Commission relating to the addition of a masonry fence and the clarification of the review and approval of exterior design changes only.*

VOTE: *YES – Michaels, Montanari, Reese, Wolf, Carter, Whiteman
NO - None*

Motion was approved by a vote of 6 to 0.

VII. REPORTS**A. African-American Heritage Trail Project Update**

**Contact Person: Aimee Angel
892-5470**

Derek Kilborn and Aimee Angel gave an update of the African-American Heritage Trail Project. Copies of the trail marker examples were distributed to the Commissioners.

Commissioner Reese and Commission Chair Carter publically thanked City staff for their hard work on this project.

**B. Historic Preservation and Adaptive Reuse
Ordinance status update.**

**Contact Person: Derek Kilborn
893-7872**

Derek Kilborn gave an update of the ordinance status. The current timeline includes scheduling a workshop in August to present the final draft to City Council, CPPC will review in September and the adoption by City Council in October.

VIII. CPPC MEMBER COMMENTS, ANNOUNCEMENTS

Commission Chair Carter announced that as Chair of this Commission he was asked to serve on one of the Pier Task Force Committees regarding historical preservation in obtaining a demolition permit. The state needs a diligent effort proving to them that historic preservation was one of the elements considered before issuing a demolition permit. He and Emily Elwyn with St. Petersburg Preservation had asked for mitigation which means they found no significant relevance to the Pier and have no objections to the demolition permit but would like to see some mitigation by way of serving historic buildings.

Commissioner Michaels gave an update of the Planning & Education Committee's progress.

VIX. ADJOURN

With no further items to come before the Commission, the public hearing was adjourned at 4:08 p.m.