STAFF REPORT
Community Planning and Preservation Commission
Certificate of Appropriateness Request

Report to the Community Planning and Preservation Commission from the Urban Planning and Historic Preservation Division, Planning and Development Services Department, for Public Hearing and Executive Action scheduled for Tuesday, January 12, 2021, beginning at 2:00 p.m., in Council Chambers of City Hall, 175 Fifth St. N., St. Petersburg, Florida. Everyone is encouraged to view the meetings on TV or online at www.stpete.org/meetings.

UPDATE: COVID-19
Procedures will be implemented to comply with the CDC guidelines during the Public Hearing, including mandatory face coverings and social distancing, with limitations on the number of attendees within Council Chambers. The City’s Planning and Development Services Department requests that you visit the City website at www.stpete.org/meetings and contact the case planner for up-to-date information pertaining to this case.

According to Planning and Development Services Department records, no member of the Community Planning and Preservation Commission resides or has a place of business within 2,000 feet of the subject property. All other possible conflicts should be declared upon the announcement of the item.

AGENDA ITEM: CITY FILE NO.: 20-90200109
PROPERTY ADDRESS: 2151 4th Avenue North
Historic Significance and Existing Conditions

The masonry vernacular house at 2151 4th Avenue North ("the subject property") is listed as a contributing resource to the Kenwood Section – Southeast Kenwood Local Historic District (18-90300001). It is additionally recorded as FMSF no. 8PI07209. The subject property was built in 1955 and is considered to be a good example of a 1950s-era ranch-style house. The house had a garage attached to the house on the rear, which was connected by a breezeway. At some point, the original garage and breezeway were enclosed to be part of the main house.

Figure 1: Rear of house, where the original garage was located. It has since been enclosed and converted into living space. The proposed garage will be located on the right side of the property.
Project Description and Review

Project Description

New Accessory Building

The application proposes the construction of a detached, 400 square foot accessory building. The new accessory building will be located near the northwest corner of the subject parcel, featuring a seven-foot rear setback from the alley and a five-foot side setback from the western property line. The building’s form will be that of a rectangle with hipped roof, which is in keeping with the primary structure.

According to the application (Appendix A), the proposed new construction will feature the following:

- A rectangular footprint of 20’ by 20’;
- A single-story hipped roof. The building’s height will be 12’ at its peak;
- A concrete slab-on-grade foundation and masonry construction;
- One-over-one single-hung sash windows; and
- Asphalt shingle roofing.

Figure 2: Proposed site plan from the application

Figure 3: Proposed elevations. The north elevation will face the rear alleyway
General Criteria for Granting Certificates of Appropriateness and Staff Findings

1. The effect of the proposed work on the landmark or the property upon which such work is to be done.
   - **Consistent**
     According to analysis done at the time of the district’s designation in 2018, approximately 58% of contributing properties featured accessory structures in addition to the primary building.
     Garages and garage apartments are the most common forms of accessory structures within the subject district. Most of the garages on this alley are of similar size and form to the proposed new construction.

2. The relationship between such work and other structures on the landmark site or other property in the historic district.
   - **Consistent**
     The proposed new construction will continue the traditional rhythm of detached garage buildings facing the alleyway.

3. The extent to which the historic, architectural, or archaeological significance, architectural style, design, arrangement, texture and materials of the local landmark or the property will be affected.
   - **Consistent**
     The proposed new construction will continue the traditional rhythm of detached garage buildings facing the alleyway. The materials proposed to be installed on the detached garage will match the primary house.

4. Whether the denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness would deprive the property owner of reasonable beneficial use of his or her property.
   - **Information not provided**

5. Whether the plans may be reasonably carried out by the applicant.
   - **Consistent**
     There is no indication that the applicant cannot carry out the proposal.

6. A COA for a noncontributing structure in a historic district shall be reviewed to determine whether the proposed work would negatively impact a contributing structure or the historic integrity of the district. Approval of a COA shall include any conditions necessary to mitigate or eliminate negative impacts.
   - **Not applicable**
     The subject property is a contributing property.

Additional Guidelines for New Construction

In approving or denying applications for a COA for new construction (which includes additions to an existing structure), the Commission and the POD shall also use the following additional guidelines.
1. **The height and scale of the proposed new construction shall be visually compatible with contributing resources in the district.**
   
   **Consistent** The proposed garage will have a roof peak of approximately 12'. This is generally consistent with historic one-story accessory buildings in the subject district.

2. **The relationship of the width of the new construction to the height of the front elevation shall be visually compatible with contributing resources in the district.**
   
   **Consistent** The proposed garage will be 20' wide. Typical historic detached single-car garages tend to be approximately 10’ to 12’ wide, and two-car detached garages and garage apartments are commonly 18’ to 24’ wide. The alleyway which the garage will be facing has numerous extant garages that are 20+ feet wide, so staff finds the width to be appropriate. The proposed height of 12 feet will be compatible with the surrounding detached garages.

3. **The relationship of the width of the windows to the height of the windows in the new construction shall be visually compatible with contributing resources in the district.**
   
   **Consistent** The proposal includes multiple windows, which will be interior facing. The applicant proposes simple one-over-one windows that look to be proportionate to the main building.

4. **The relationship of solids and voids (which is the pattern or rhythm created by wall recesses, projections, and openings) in the front facade of a building shall be visually compatible with contributing resources in the district.**
   
   **Consistent** Detached garages typically have fairly utilitarian, often sparse, fenestration patterns. The proposed garage is in keeping with the district in regarding fenestration patterns on detached garages.

5. **The relationship of the new construction to open space between it and adjoining buildings shall be visually compatible with contributing resources in the district.**
   
   **Consistent** The accessory building’s location at the rear (north) fence line is consistent with similar accessory buildings in the subject district.

6. **The relationship of the entrance and porch projections, and balconies to sidewalks of the new construction shall be visually compatible with contributing resources in the district.**
   
   **Not applicable** The proposed building faces the rear alleyway. Its relationship with that element of the district is consistent with contributing resources.

7. **The relationship of the materials and texture of the facade of the new construction shall be visually compatible with the predominant materials used in contributing resources in the district.**
   
   **Consistent** The proposed materials will be compatible with the main house and other contributing resources in the district.
8. The roof shape of the new construction shall be visually compatible with contributing resources in the district.

**Consistent** The proposed roof has a 5:12 hipped roof. This is consistent with comparable contributing resources.

9. Appurtenances of the new construction such as walls, gates and fences, vegetation and landscape features, shall, if necessary, form cohesive walls of enclosures along a street, to ensure visual compatibility of the new construction with contributing resources in the district.

**Consistent** The accessory building’s location at the rear (north) fence line is consistent with similar accessory buildings in the subject district.

10. The mass of the new construction in relation to open spaces, the windows, door openings, porches and balconies shall be visually compatible with contributing resources in the district.

**Consistent** The utilitarian nature of many of the accessory buildings (particularly garages) in the subject district results in comparably less fenestrations than primary residences. Staff finds the proposed massing and rhythm of the accessory building to be generally in keeping with that found in the subject district.

11. The new construction shall be visually compatible with contributing resources in the district in its orientation, flow, and directional character, whether this is the vertical, horizontal, or static character.

**Consistent** The overall form, massing, and placement of the proposed accessory building are key elements in creating a structure that blends in with the surrounding alley-scape. These characteristics are in keeping with surrounding accessory buildings.

12. New construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the local landmark or contributing property to a local landmark district. The new construction shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the local landmark and its environment, or the local landmark district.

**Consistent** No historic material will be destroyed.

13. New construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the local landmark and its environment would be unimpaired.

**Consistent**
Summary of Findings

Staff evaluation yields a finding of the following criteria being met by the proposed project:

- General Criteria for Granting Certificates of Appropriateness: 4 of 4 relevant criteria met or partially met.
- Additional Guidelines for New Construction: 12 of 12 relevant criteria met or generally satisfied.

Staff Recommendation and Conditions of Approval

Based on a determination of general consistency with Chapter 16, City Code of Ordinances, staff recommends that the Community Planning and Preservation Commission approve with conditions the Certificate of Appropriateness request for the alteration of the property 2151 4th Ave. N., subject to the following:

1. Windows will be installed to be setback within the wall plane and feature a reveal of at least two inches.
2. All other necessary permits shall be obtained. Any additional work shall be presented to staff for determination of the necessity of additional COA approval.
3. This approval will be valid for 24 months beginning on the date of revocation of the local Emergency Declaration.
Appendix A:

Application No. 20-90200109 and Submittals
CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
APPLICATION

All applications are to be filled out completely and correctly. The application shall be submitted to the City of St. Petersburg’s Planning and Development Services Department, located on the 8th floor of the Municipal Services Building, One Fourth Street North, St. Petersburg, Florida. Laura Duvekot, Historic Preservationist II, (727) 892-5451 or Laura.Duvekot@stpete.org

GENERAL INFORMATION

2151 4th Ave N St. Petersburg FL 33713
Property Address
SE Kenwood Historic District
Historic District / Landmark Name
Pamela Scherer
Owner’s Name
2151 4th Ave N St. Petersburg FL 33713
Owner’s Address, City, State, Zip Code
NA
Authorized Representative (Name & Title), if applicable
NA
Representative’s Address, City, State, Zip Code

APPLICATION TYPE (Check applicable)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Addition</td>
<td>Window Replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Construction</td>
<td>Door Replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demolition</td>
<td>Roof Replacement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relocation</td>
<td>Mechanical (e.g. solar)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TYPE OF WORK (Check applicable)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Repair Only</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-Kind Replacement</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Installation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

AUTHORIZED

By signing this application, the applicant affirms that all information contained within this application packet has been read and that the information on this application represents an accurate description of the proposed work. The applicant certifies that the project described in this application, as detailed by the plans and specifications enclosed, will be constructed in exact accordance with aforesaid plans and specifications. Further, the applicant agrees to conform to all conditions of approval. It is understood that approval of this application by the Community Planning and Preservation Commission in no way constitutes approval of a building permit or other required City permit approvals. Filing an application does not guarantee approval.

NOTES: 1) It is incumbent upon the applicant to submit correct information. Any misleading, deceptive, incomplete or incorrect information may invalidate your approval.
2) To accept an agent’s signature, a notarized letter of authorization from the property owner must accompany the application.

Signature of Owner: [Signature] Date: 11/09/2020
Signature of Representative: NA Date:
All applications are to be filled out completely and correctly. The application shall be submitted to the City of St. Petersburg's Planning and Development Services Department by emailing directly to Historic Preservationists Laura Duvekot (Laura.Duvekot@stpete.org) or Kelly Perkins (Kelly.Perkins@stpete.org).

**PROPOSED SCOPE OF WORK**

Please provide a detailed description of the proposed work, organized according to the COA Matrix. Include information such as materials, location, square footage, etc. as applicable. Attach supplementary material as needed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Building or Site Feature</th>
<th>Photo No.</th>
<th>Proposed Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Garage</td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Addition of Residential Garage</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Status Detail

Parcel ID:
24/31/16/11808/004/0150/

Address:
2151 4TH AVE N

Application Date:
10/09/20

Owner:
SCHERER, PAMELA

Application #:
20 - 10000695

Application Type:
ADDITIONS OF RESIDENTIAL GARAGES AND CARPORTS

Valuation:
$21,400

Square Footage:
000000400

Tenant Name:

Application Status:
IN PROCESS

Tenant Unit Number:

General Contractor:
RENOVATIONS INC FL

Zoning Description:
No Structure Found

Appendix B:
Maps of Subject Property
Southeast Kenwood Local Historic District

Community Planning and Preservation Commission
2151 4th Ave. N

AREA TO BE APPROVED,
SHOWN IN

CASE NUMBER
20-90200109

SCALE: 1" = 100'
Southeast Kenwood Local Historic District